

**CULVER CITY UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT
COMMUNITY BUDGET ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES**

**Place: District Administration Office
4034 Irving Place
Culver City, CA 90232**

**Date: February 4, 2009
Time: 6:15 p.m.**

Committee Members Present

David El Fattal, Chairperson
Janet Chabola, Representative
Alan Elmont, Alternate
Christine Feely
Richard Hibbs
Patricia Jaffe, District Representative
Bonita Knox
Michael Laase, Representative
Jackie Lee, Classified Representative
David Mielke, Certificated Representative

Committee Members Absent

Michael Arena, Alternate
Cynthia Deneve, Parent Rep (LB)
Kristin Miller, Parent Rep (ER)
Ron Ostrin, Representative
June Poyourow, Parent Rep (EM)
Laurie Schwartz, Parent Rep (OCD & LH)

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 6:17p.m. with Mr. David El Fattal presiding. Ms. Rosalinda LaBriola led the pledge of allegiance.

Approval of Minutes

Mrs. Janet Chabola moved to approve the minutes of the January 14, 2009 meeting. Mrs. Michael Laase seconded the motion. The minutes were unanimously approved.

Discussion of Budget & Potential Expenditure Reductions

Mr. El Fattal provided information on the following items:

- Potential budget reductions that were presented to the Board during a special meeting held on February 3, 2009.
- CBAC needs to prioritize the potential budget reductions list.
- Lay-off resolutions will go to the Board on February 24, 2009.
- CBAC rankings and comments will be presented at the February 24, 2009 meeting.
- Budget reduction projections have changed based on the latest information from the State and are now estimated to be between \$3.7 and \$4 million. Last year, we cut \$2 million.
- Some funds that are based on categorical programs can be swept into the general fund; so programs should be eliminated.
- The District cuts must be ongoing.

A discussion ensued which included the following comments:

- Mr. Elmont: What is the probability of enlisting a number of districts in the state to employ civil disobedience and not balance their budgets? Powerful teachers' union should flex muscles; need people to speak up.
 - Mr. El Fattal: I have not heard much from colleagues about civil disobedience. Our three percent reserve equates to \$1.7 million, which will not make a large enough dent. Cuts have to happen.
- Mr. Elmont: What are repercussions if the District's budget is not balanced?
 - Mr. Delawalla: The District would need a plan for the second and third years to present to the County.
 - Mr. El Fattal: Without a plan, the District's budget would likely be negative within one year and the State would take over the District if we run out of cash. Then, the Board would have no power.
- Ms. Lee: I understand each site/department needs to cut 25%.
 - Mr. Delawalla: We have not yet received items from all sites. Some cuts will be this year, while others will fall into next year.
- Ms. Lee: Are you cutting attorney fees?
 - Mr. El Fattal: We won't use all of the funds put into the legal fee budget.
- Ms. Lee: There is no reason to have an attorney present at the first session of negotiations.
 - Mr. El Fattal: The District does receive some reimbursement through the mandated cost program. In 2006-2007, we received \$500,000 for all mandated programs.
- Mr. Mielke: How will the Federal stimulus program and funds affect lay-offs?
 - Mr. El Fattal:

2009

Title 1-A Increase	\$ 178,300
Construction	\$ 610,300
IDEA Increase	<u>\$ 551,900</u>
	\$ 1,340,600

2010

Title 1-A Increase	\$ 178,300
IDEA Increase	<u>\$ 633,200</u>
	\$ 811,600

Grand Total \$ 2,152,200

- Mr. Elmont: Would these funds free up money?
 - Mr. Delawalla: That depends on availability of matching funds
- Mrs. Chabola: Are we already considering workers comp funds and other previous reserves?
 - Mr. El Fattal: \$3.7 million figure includes everything.

Mr. El Fattal reviewed unrestricted and restricted potential cuts.

- **#10 K-3 Class Size Reduction**

- Mr. Gray: Some classes have more than 20 at Farragut.
 - Mr. El Fattal: If over 20, we are penalized.
 - Mr. Delawalla: 20.44 per class. If enrollment is over there's a 20% penalty, at 22 = 80% = \$1,071 per student.
 - Mr. El Fattal: Number of students can increase if approved. I toured schools and most rooms can fit 22; some can fit 27-30. The principals are comfortable with 22. If no penalty, then can bump it up and eliminate eight teachers.

- **#1 – Eliminate Stipends**

- Ms. LaBriola: If you don't offer program, there is no need for a stipend.

- **#4 – Eliminate Elementary PE Instructional Aides**

- Ms. Lee questioned cost with benefits for aides working 3.5 hours per day (\$17,000)
 - Mr. Delawalla: 24% statutory benefits are included in the amount. Flexibility is in state programs; Title I is Federal.
- Ms. LaBriola: Site Councils decide on positions.
 - Mr. Delawalla: Site Council might also decide on use of funds.

- **#9 – Eliminate Positions (39 positions; 8 = 21% of District Office)**

- Mr. Elmont: What percentage of overhead does it represent?
- Mr. Mielke: Are these clerical or administrative? What does this mean? Teachers don't have secretaries.
 - Mr. El Fattal: There is a combination of clerical and administrative.
- Ms. Feeley: CBAC does not have the right to say who should be eliminated. Secretaries might do more than just type.
- Mr. Elmont: In business, people are paid on job. The people making more money, do more.
- Ms. Lee: Does not include TOSA positions. Where are they?
 - Mrs. Jaffe: They are on another list.
 - Mr. Delawalla: They are paid out of restricted funds. BTSA is State.
- Ms. Lee: If TOSA's go back to the classroom, where are the savings?
- Mr. Silberberger: Are there teachers going back to the classroom who are not BTSA?
 - A discussion ensued regarding savings of TOSA's going back to the classroom
- Mr. Hibbs: Read article. Look at administrative costs compared to teachers.
- Mr. Elmont: Administrative costs at CCUSD are comparable.
 - Mr. El Fattal: All districts report the number of administrators and teachers. CCUSD is short on administrators. A report has been given to the group in the past.

- **#11 – 4th & 5th Grade Class Size Reduction**

- Mr. Elmont: What would it take to raise the number of teachers to four?
 - Mr. Delawalla: Increase class size to 31.
- Mr. Elmont: Proposed raising the number to 31.

- o Mr. Gray: Stated opposition to raising class size; need to know how to implement it. How will District do it?
 - Mr. El Fattal: There are several ways to do this. Do you want classes to be 31:1 or 30:1? Last year there was a discussion of 4th and 5th grade combo's or keep teachers and smaller classes. A decision was made last year to keep teachers and small classes. That might not happen this year.
 - o Mr. Mielke: Union proposal – Pay teachers extra for combo classes.
 - Mr. Delawalla: Each additional student in each class equals one FTE.
 - o Mr. Elmont: Stated he knows District will not eliminate some items but is suggesting 31 students per class. Biggest expense is staff (teachers).
 - o Ms. LaBriola: I don't have concern with 31 students but moving students is a problem.
 - o Ms. Feeley: Moving students creates social issues.
 - o Mr. El Fattal: This year is more severe; we may have to take drastic action.
 - o Mrs. Chabola: We have not asked the community to sacrifice. Need to raise the bar; might have to ask students to move.
- **#14 – Eliminate Instructional Aides**
 - o Ms. Lee: How many positions does this include? Will it affect teachers?
 - Mr. Delawalla: 21 positions are included.
 - o Ms. Lee: Mostly ELD aids – kindergarten aides, computer aides. What about behaviorists, etc?
- **#18 – Special Education**
 - o Ms. Lee: What about SELPA?
- **#19 – Eliminate Galileo**
 - o Ms. LaBriola: Is this site or district?
 - Mr. El Fattal: Both
- **#22 – Eliminate Website Contract**
 - o Ms. Lee: What do they maintain?
 - o Mr. Elmont: They carry it and maintain it.

Mr. El Fattal reviewed one-time savings list.

- **#24 – Eliminate Four Days of Staff Development**
 - o Mr. Mielke: District would have had to propose it, in negotiations.
 - Mr. El Fattal: This would be for next year.
- **#26 – Freeze Step and Column**
 - o Does not affect all employees – Many employees are at a top step and would not be affected.
 - o Due to legal issues, a freeze would be considered a loan; would have to make up losses in the future.

Mr. El Fattal asked the Committee if they wanted to add anything.

- Mr. Elmont: CBAC should vote and have weighted factor (i.e. 1, 2, and 3).
- Ms. Lee: Totaled – negotiable items - \$2.866 million; leaves \$2.42 million
- Mr. Mielke: Cannot discuss negotiable items; leave for negotiations.
- Mr. Elmont: Agrees w/Mr. Mielke regarding negotiable items.

- Mr. Gray: Why isn't the Director of I.T. on this?
 - Mr. El Fattal: Position is included in Item #9.
- Ms. LaBriola: Disagrees regarding negotiable items; believes they should have weighted value on them.
- Mr. Mielke: Will be lively discussion
- Mrs. Chabola: Disagrees

Mr. El Fattal stated that the CBAC meeting would run until 8:30 p.m.

- Mr. Mielke: Stated when he has tried to bring information in the past regarding comparable districts, he was told he couldn't. Now CBAC wants to make decisions on negotiable items. Going down slippery slope.
- Mrs. Laase: Agrees with Mr. Mielke:
- Mrs. Chabola: Doesn't see it as negotiating but rather recommending.
- Ms. Lee: Want to address I.T. Director – recommendation made to not cut the position. If position is cut, the District would need to outsource and pay a lot.
- Ms. Feeley: Don't know how much would save.
- Mr. Gray: Wouldn't miss it at my elementary school.
- Ms. LaBriola: Has had excellent service.
- Ms. Lee: In previous position, found the Director of I.T. provided service.
- Mrs. Hibbs: Agree w/Mrs. Chabola – CBAC is just making recommendations to present to the Superintendent.

Additions to List:

- Mrs. Chabola: Deeper cuts in security.
- Mr. Elmont: Increase class size by one student each and increase teacher reduction by 3 more.
- Mr. Gray: Can we spend any capital \$6.5 million in energy savings
 - Mr. Delawalla: It is for construction only.
- Mr. Elmont: Could spend on solar panels.
 - Mr. El Fattal: Can borrow for cashflow.
- Ms. Lee: Asst. Principals at the middle and high schools – taken off table.
- Mr. Mielke: Bump up district office cuts to nine. Cut PR consultant. Rescind second round of raises to management. No employee should make more than \$8,000 per month. Teachers took 2.7% less than median raise.
- Mr. Elmont: Consider a 1.5% salary decrease.
- Mr. Hibbs: What about revenue increases – parcel tax?
 - Mr. El Fattal: A parcel tax would be discussed at the next board meeting (2/10/09).

The Committee then agreed to rank the list of potential cuts, 1 being highest priority and 3 the lowest priority. Union representatives from both bargaining groups abstained from voting on negotiable items.

- Mr. Elmont stated that CCUSD needs to engage other districts in civil disobedience to be qualified at the Second Interim Report.
- Ms. Lee: We need to get parents to march on Sacramento.
- Mrs. Chabola: District Superintendent needs to have website linked to Karen Bass' website.

Next Meeting Dates

February 25, 2009

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 8:47 p.m.